Inspection report on compliance with HTA licensing standards Inspection date: 18 October 2023



Sunderland Royal Hospital

HTA licensing number 22610

Licensed under the Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended)

Licensable activities carried out by the establishment

'E' = Establishment is licensed to carry out this activity and is currently carrying it out.

'E*' = Establishment is licensed to carry out this activity but is not currently carrying it out.

Site	Procurement	Processing	Testing	Storage	Distribution	Import	Export
Sunderland Royal Hospital	E*			E			

Tissue types authorised for licensed activities

Authorised = Establishment is authorised to carry out this activity and is currently carrying it out.

Authorised* = Establishment is authorised to carry out this activity but is not currently carrying it out.

Tissue Category; Tissue Type	Procurement	Processing	Testing	Storage	Distribution	Import	Export
Musculoskeletal, Cartilage; Cartilage (ATMP)	Authorised*						
Musculoskeletal, Tendon & Ligament; Tendons				Authorised			
Musculoskeletal, Bone; Bone				Authorised			

Summary of inspection findings

The HTA found the Designated Individual (DI) and the Licence Holder (LH) to be suitable in accordance with the requirements of the legislation.

Although the HTA found that Sunderland Royal Hospital (the establishment) had met the majority of the HTA's standards that were assessed during the inspection, two major and four minor shortfalls were found against standards for Governance and Quality, and Premises, Facilities and Equipment.

The HTA has assessed the establishment as suitable to be licensed for the activities specified, subject to corrective and preventative actions being implemented to meet the shortfalls identified during the inspection. Two of the shortfalls relate to findings from the two previous inspections, which were closed based on assurances from the Designated Individual (DI) that the agreed actions had been completed. However, at the time of this inspection it was identified that these had not been fully addressed. In light of the recurring nature of the two shortfalls, these have been escalated to major findings. The HTA will consider the need for further regulatory action in relation to these findings.

Compliance with HTA standards

Major shortfalls

GQ6 A coding and records system facilitates traceability of bodies, body parts, tissues and cells, ensuring a robust audit trail.

b) An audit trail is maintained, which includes details of when the tissues and / or cells were acquired and from where, the uses to which the tissues and / or cells were put, when the tissues and / or cells were transferred elsewhere and to whom.

The establishment uses a logbook to record the receipt, storage, use or disposal of allografts purchased from another HTA-licensed establishment. According to the establishment's procedure this information is also recorded within the electronic procurement inventory.

During the review of the patient records two examples were seen where traceability information was only recorded on the paper-based logbook and not the electronic inventory. Furthermore, examples were seen where the disposal of tissue was only recorded within the logbook.

This is a recurrent issue that was identified on the previous inspection and it has not yet been fully addressed. The classification of this finding as a major shortfall reflects this.

Major

GQ8 Risk assessments of the establishment's practices and processes are completed regularly and are recorded and monitored appropriately.

b) Risk assessments are reviewed regularly, as a minimum annually or when any changes are made that may affect the quality and safety of tissues and cells.

There is no annual review of the risk assessments for all practices and processes relating to the licensable activities.

Major

This is a recurrent issue that was identified on the previous two inspections and it has not yet been fully addressed. The classification of this finding as a major shortfall reflects this.

Minor Shortfalls

Standard	Inspection findings	Level of shortfall		
GQ1 All aspects of the establishment's work are supported by ratified documented policies and procedures as part of the overall governance process.				
b) There are procedures for all licensable activities that ensure integrity of tissue and / or cells and minimise the risk of contamination.	Examples were seen during the inspection where the establishment did not follow its documented procedures. For example, a few days prior the inspection the -40°C freezer broke down. Tissue products in storage were taken to a -40°C freezer in a different department and staff tried to contact the DI. However, staff were not able to contact the DI and failed to follow the escalation process, which would involve contacting the PD and then the CLHc. On another occasion the freezer appeared to have malfunctioned. Following investigation by the engineer this was shown to be a false alarm. Neither incident was reported on the internal incident system. Furthermore, the contingency procedure which involves storing the tissue products in the back-up -40°C freezer is not documented.	Minor		

Standard	Inspection findings	Level of shortfall		
GQ3 Staff are appropriately qualified skills.	and trained in techniques relevant to their work and are continuously u	pdating their		
e) Personnel are trained in all tasks relevant to their work and their competence is recorded.	Although the establishment occasionally undertakes staff training in tasks relevant to their work and the regulatory context there is no formal documented training programme. Furthermore, an example was seen	Minor		
f) There is a documented training programme that ensures that staff have adequate knowledge of the scientific and ethical principles relevant to their work, and the regulatory context.	where training had taken place, but the topics covered and the staff that had attended were not recorded.			
GQ4 There is a systematic and planned approach to the management of records.				
h) Raw data which are critical to the safety and quality of tissues and cells are kept for 10 years after the use, expiry date or disposal of tissues and / or cells.	Since the previous inspection the establishment has installed a new freezer. At the time of writing the report the establishment was unable to provide the temperature monitoring records from the old freezer.	Minor		

PFE5 Equipment is appropriate for use, maintained, quality assured, validated and where appropriate monitored.			
b) Critical equipment is maintained and serviced in accordance with the manufacturer's instructions.	At the time of the inspection the temperature probe within the establishment's -40°C freezer had not been calibrated in accordance with the manufacturer's requirements.	Minor	

The HTA requires the DI to submit a completed corrective and preventative action (CAPA) plan setting out how the shortfalls will be addressed, within 14 days of receipt of the final report (refer to Appendix 2 for recommended timeframes within which to complete actions). The HTA will then inform the establishment of the evidence required to demonstrate that the actions agreed in the plan have been completed.

Advice

The HTA advises the DI to consider the following to further improve practice:

Number	Standard	Advice
1.	GQ1b	The establishment's documentation regularly refers to the Human Tissue Act 2004 and the Code of Practice F - Donation of Solid Organ or Tissue for Transplantation but does not mention the Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended), which is the legislation that the establishment is working under.
		The DI is advised to update the establishment's documentation to ensure that it is relevant and correct for the activities related to Human Application.
2.	GQ1b/ GQ8a	Although the establishment is licensed to procure cartilage for Advanced Therapy Medicinal Product (ATMP) production it is not currently undertaking this activity. The DI is advised to ensure procedures, risk assessments and agreements are put in place prior to resuming this activity in the future. The DI is

		also advised to consider any licensing implications for the testing and distribution/ export of the starting material to the manufacturer of the ATMP and seek advice from the HTA.
3.	GQ2b/ PFE5c	The DI is advised to consider initiating a programme by which, at suitable intervals, the temperature plots from the -40°C freezer are reviewed. This may help to identify a potential failure of this equipment before it occurs.
4.	GQ2c	The establishment undertakes an independent audit including a traceability audit of patient records. The DI is strongly advised to include as part of the audit a review of the raw data, such as the temperature monitoring records for the -40°C freezer.
5.	GQ4a	The establishment has a quality management system where documents have version control and review dates. The DI is advised to include the Risk Assessment Sheet for the ACI procedure and the Allograft Implant Inventory Guide under the quality management system and ensure these documents also have version numbers and review histories.
6.	GQ4h	The establishment's procedure on the retention of raw data (SOP138) sets out that these will be retained indefinitely. The DI is advised to update the procedure to reflect that raw data is kept for 10 years after the use, expiry or disposal of tissues and / or cells, as required by Directions 001/2021.
7.	GQ6d	Staff at the establishment record the Single European Code (SEC), a forty-digit alphanumeric traceability code of the tissue products received. Currently there is no second person verification to minimise the risk of transcription errors that may result in loss of traceability. Also, following EU Exit the requirements of the SEC are applicable in Northern Ireland only. The DI is advised to risk assess this process and consider whether mitigating action is needed to prevent loss of traceability.

8. GQ7a		The DI is strongly advised to create a local procedure for non-conformances and non-reportable incidents, including how they are logged, investigated and closed to enable staff at the establishment to review and trend any incidents.
		The DI is also advised to consider including examples of deviations, reportable incidents and non-reportable incidents as part of staff induction and ongoing training to ensure that all members of staff understand the process and what it involves.

Background

Sunderland Royal Hospital is licensed for the storage of bone and tendon products. It is also licensed for the procurement of cartilage as a starting material for ATMP manufacture, but it is not currently undertaking this activity.

The establishment has been licensed by the HTA since December 2010. This was the establishment's seventh inspection; the last inspection took place in November 2021.

There have been no significant changes to the licence arrangements or the activities carried out under the licence since the previous inspection.

Description of inspection activities undertaken

The HTA's regulatory requirements are set out in Appendix 1. The following areas were covered during the inspection:

Review of governance documentation

A review of selected documentation relevant to the establishment's licensable activities and quality management system was undertaken, including a review of policies and procedural documents, temperature monitoring records, independent audit, risk assessments, staff training records and incidents. A discussion was held about the corrective actions taken for the closure of the shortfalls from the previous inspection.

Visual inspection

A review of the facilities was conducted at the establishment, including areas where receipt and storage of the tissue products takes place. At the time of the inspection the -40°C freezer was broken down and no tissue products were in storage. The paper-based logbook was reviewed against the electronic procurement inventory for four bone products and one tendon product that were implanted, and for two bone products and one tendon product that were discarded. A few discrepancies were noted.

Audit of records

Representative records relating to the receipt, storage, end use or disposal, where applicable, were reviewed for five femoral heads, one bone wedge and two achilles tendons.

Meetings with establishment staff

Discussions were held with the DI and staff carrying out processes under the licence.

Report sent to DI for factual accuracy: 2023-12-08

Report returned from DI: No factual accuracy or request for redaction comments were made by the DI

Final report issued: 2024-01-03

Appendix 1: The HTA's regulatory requirements

The HTA must assure itself that the DI, Licence Holder, premises and practices are suitable.

The statutory duties of the DI are set down in Section 18 of the Human Tissue Act 2004. They are to secure that:

- the other persons to whom the licence applies are suitable persons to participate in the carrying-on of the licensed activity;
- suitable practices are used in the course of carrying on that activity; and
- the conditions of the licence are complied with.

The HTA developed its licensing standards with input from its stakeholders. They are designed to ensure the safe and ethical use of human tissue and the dignified and respectful treatment of the deceased. The HTA inspects the establishments it licences against four groups of standards:

- consent
- · governance and quality systems
- premises facilities and equipment
- disposal.

This is an exception-based report: only those standards that have been assessed as not met are included. Where the HTA determines that a standard is not met, the level of the shortfall is classified as 'Critical', 'Major' or 'Minor' (see Appendix 2: Classification of the level of shortfall). Where HTA standards are fully met, but the HTA has identified an area of practice that could be further improved, advice is given to the DI.

Reports of HTA inspections carried out from 1 November 2010 are published on the HTA's website.

Appendix 2: Classification of the level of shortfall

Where the HTA determines that a licensing standard is not met, the improvements required will be stated and the level of the shortfall will be classified as 'Critical', 'Major' or 'Minor'. Where the HTA is not presented with evidence that an establishment meets the requirements of an expected standard, it works on the premise that a lack of evidence indicates a shortfall.

The action an establishment will be required to make following the identification of a shortfall is based on the HTA's assessment of risk of harm and/or a breach of the Human Tissue Act 2004, Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended), or associated Directions.

1. Critical shortfall:

A shortfall which poses a significant direct risk of causing harm to a recipient patient or to a living donor,

or

A number of 'major' shortfalls, none of which is critical on its own, but viewed cumulatively represent a systemic failure and therefore are considered 'critical'.

A critical shortfall may result in one or more of the following:

- A notice of proposal being issued to revoke the licence
- Some or all of the licensable activity at the establishment ceasing with immediate effect until a corrective action plan is developed, agreed by the HTA and implemented.
- A notice of suspension of licensable activities
- Additional conditions being proposed
- Directions being issued requiring specific action to be taken straightaway

2. Major shortfall:

A non-critical shortfall.

A shortfall in the carrying out of licensable activities which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or a recipient

or

A shortfall in the establishment's quality and safety procedures which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or a recipient;

or

A shortfall which indicates a major deviation from the Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended) or the HTA Directions;

or

A shortfall which indicates a failure to carry out satisfactory procedures for the release of tissues and cells or a failure on the part of the designated individual to fulfil his or her legal duties;

or

A combination of several 'minor' shortfalls, none of which is major on its own, but which, viewed cumulatively, could constitute a major shortfall by adversely affecting the quality and safety of the tissues and cells.

In response to a major shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 1-2 months of the issue of the final inspection report. Major shortfalls pose a higher level of risk and therefore a shorter deadline is given, compared to minor shortfalls, to ensure the level of risk is reduced in an appropriate timeframe.

3. Minor shortfall:

A shortfall which cannot be classified as either critical or major and, which can be addressed by further development by the establishment.

This category of shortfall requires the development of a corrective action plan, the results of which will usually be assessed by

the HTA either by desk-based review or at the time of the next on-site inspection.

In response to a minor shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 3-4 months of the issue of the final inspection report.

Follow up actions

A template corrective and preventative action plan will be sent as a separate Word document with the final inspection report. Establishments must complete this template and return it to the HTA within 14 days of the issue of the final report.

Based on the level of the shortfall, the HTA will consider the most suitable type of follow-up of the completion of the corrective and preventative action plan. This may include a combination of

- a follow-up inspection
- a request for information that shows completion of actions
- monitoring of the action plan completion
- follow up at next routine inspection.

After an assessment of the proposed action plan establishments will be notified of the follow-up approach the HTA will take.

Appendix 3: HTA standards

The HTA standards applicable to this establishment are shown below; those not assessed during the inspection are shown in grey text. Individual standards which are not applicable to this establishment have been excluded.

Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 Standards (as amended)

Consent

Standard

C1 Consent is obtained in accordance with the requirements of the HT Act 2004, the Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended) and as set out in the HTA's Codes of Practice.

- a) If the establishment acts as a procurer of tissues and / or cells, there is an established process for acquiring donor consent which meets the requirements of the HT Act 2004 the Human Tissue (Quality and Safety for Human Application) Regulations 2007 (as amended) and the HTA's Codes of Practice.
- c) The establishment or the third party's procedure on obtaining donor consent includes how potential donors are identified and who is able to take consent.
- d) Consent forms comply with the HTA Codes of Practice.
- e) Completed consent forms are included in records and are made accessible to those using or releasing tissue and / or cells for a Scheduled Purpose.

C2 Information about the consent process is provided and in a variety of formats.

- a) The procedure on obtaining consent details what information will be provided to donors. As a minimum, the information specified by Directions 001/2021 is included.
- c) Information is available in suitable formats and there is access to independent interpreters when required.

d) There are procedures to ensure that information is provided to the donor or donor's family by trained personnel.

C3 Staff involved in seeking consent receive training and support in the implications and essential requirements of taking consent.

- a) Staff involved in obtaining consent are provided with training on how to take informed consent in accordance with the requirements of the HT Act 2004 and Code of Practice on Consent.
- b) Training records are kept demonstrating attendance at training on consent.

Governance and Quality

Standard

GQ1 All aspects of the establishment's work are supported by ratified documented policies and procedures as part of the overall governance process.

- a) There is an organisational chart clearly defining the lines of accountability and reporting relationships.
- b) There are procedures for all licensable activities that ensure integrity of tissue and / or cells and minimise the risk of contamination.
- c) There are regular governance meetings, for example health and safety, risk management and clinical governance committees, which are recorded by agendas and minutes.
- d) There is a document control system to ensure that changes to documents are reviewed, approved, dated and documented by an authorised person and only current documents are in use.
- e) There are procedures for tissue and / or cell procurement, which ensure the safety of living donors.

- g) There are procedures to ensure that an authorised person verifies that tissues and / or cells received by the establishment meet required specifications.
- h) There are procedures for the management and quarantine of non-conforming consignments or those with incomplete test results, to ensure no risk of cross contamination.
- i) There are procedures to ensure tissues and / or cells are not released from quarantine until verification has been completed and recorded.
- k) There is a procedure for handling returned products.
- I) There are procedures to ensure that in the event of termination of activities for whatever reason, stored tissues and / or cells are transferred to another licensed establishment or establishments.
- m) The criteria for allocating tissues and / or cells to patients and health care institutions are documented and made available to these parties on request.
- o) There is a complaints system in place.
- t) There are procedures for the re-provision of service in an emergency.
- GQ2 There is a documented system of quality management and audit.
- a) There is a quality management system which ensures continuous and systematic improvement.
- b) There is an internal audit system for all licensable activities.
- c) An audit is conducted in an independent manner at least every two years to verify compliance with protocols and HTA standards, and any findings and corrective actions are documented.
- d) Processes affecting the quality and safety of tissues and / or cells are validated and undergo regular evaluation to ensure they continue to achieve the intended results.

GQ3 Staff are appropriately qualified and trained in techniques relevant to their work and are continuously updating their skills.

- a) There are clearly documented job descriptions for all staff.
- b) There are orientation and induction programmes for new staff.
- c) There are continuous professional development (CPD) plans for staff and attendance at training is recorded.
- d) There is annual documented mandatory training (e.g. health and safety and fire).
- e) Personnel are trained in all tasks relevant to their work and their competence is recorded.
- f) There is a documented training programme that ensures that staff have adequate knowledge of the scientific and ethical principles relevant to their work, and the regulatory context.
- g) There is a documented training programme that ensures that staff understand the organisational structure and the quality systems used within the establishment.
- h) There is a system of staff appraisal.
- i) Where appropriate, staff are registered with a professional or statutory body.
- j) There are training and reference manuals available.
- k) The establishment is sufficiently staffed to carry out its activities.
- GQ4 There is a systematic and planned approach to the management of records.
- a) There are procedures for the creation, identification, maintenance, access, amendment, retention and destruction of records.
- b) There is a system for the regular audit of records and their content to check for completeness, legibility and accuracy and to resolve any discrepancies found.

- c) Written records are legible and indelible. Records kept in other formats such as computerised records are stored on a validated system.
- d) There is a system for back-up / recovery in the event of loss of computerised records.
- e) The establishment keeps a register of the types and quantities of tissues and / or cells that are procured, tested, preserved, processed, stored and distributed or otherwise disposed of, and on the origin and destination of tissues and cells intended for human application.
- f) There are procedures to ensure that donor documentation, as specified by Directions 001/2021, is collected and maintained.
- g) There is a system to ensure records are secure and that donor confidentiality is maintained in accordance with Directions 001/2021.
- h) Raw data which are critical to the safety and quality of tissues and cells are kept for 10 years after the use, expiry date or disposal of tissues and / or cells.
- i) The minimum data to ensure traceability from donor to recipient as required by Directions 001/2021 are kept for 30 years after the use, expiry or disposal of tissues and / or cells.
- j) Records are kept of products and material coming into contact with the tissues and / or cells.
- I) The establishment records the acceptance or rejection of tissue and / or cells that it receives and in the case of rejection why this rejection occurred.
- m) In the event of termination of activities of the establishment a contingency plan to ensure records of traceability are maintained for 10 or 30 years as required.

GQ5 There are documented procedures for donor selection and exclusion, including donor criteria.

a) Donors are selected either by the establishment or the third party acting on its behalf in accordance with the criteria required by Directions 001/2021.

- b) The testing of donors by the establishment or a third party on behalf of the establishment is carried out in accordance with the requirements of Directions 001/2021.
- d) There is a system in place either at the establishment or at a third party acting on its behalf to record results of donor selection and associated tests.
- e) Testing of donor samples is carried out using UKCA or CE marked diagnostic tests, in line with the requirements set out in Directions 001/2021.
- f) Samples taken for donor testing are clearly labelled with the time and place the sample was taken and a unique donor identification code.

GQ6 A coding and records system facilitates traceability of tissues and / or cells, ensuring a robust audit trail.

- a) There is a donor identification system which assigns a unique code to each donation and to each of the products associated with it.
- b) An audit trail is maintained, which includes details of when the tissues and / or cells were acquired and from where, the uses to which the tissues and / or cells were put, when the tissues and / or cells were transferred elsewhere and to whom.
- c) The establishment has procedures to ensure that tissues and / or cells imported, procured, processed, stored, distributed and exported are traceable from donor to recipient and vice versa.

GQ7 There are systems to ensure that all adverse events, reactions and/or incidents are investigated promptly.

- a) There are procedures for the identification, reporting, investigation and recording of adverse events and reactions, including documentation of any corrective or preventative actions.
- b) There is a system to receive and distribute national and local information (e.g. HTA regulatory alerts) and notify the HTA and other establishments as necessary of serious adverse events or reactions.
- c) The responsibilities of personnel investigating adverse events and reactions are clearly defined.

- d) There are procedures to identify and decide the fate of tissues and / or cells affected by an adverse event, reaction or deviation from the required quality and safety standards.
- e) In the event of a recall, there are personnel authorised within the establishment to assess the need for a recall and if appropriate initiate and coordinate a recall.
- f) There is an effective, documented recall procedure which includes a description of responsibilities and actions to be taken in the event of a recall including notification of the HTA and pre-defined times in which actions must be taken.

GQ8 Risk assessments of the establishment's practices and processes are completed regularly and are recorded and monitored appropriately.

- a) There are documented risk assessments for all practices and processes.
- b) Risk assessments are reviewed regularly, as a minimum annually or when any changes are made that may affect the quality and safety of tissues and cells.
- c) Staff can access risk assessments and are made aware of local hazards at training.
- d) A documented risk assessment is carried out to decide the fate of any tissue and / or cells stored prior to the introduction of a new donor selection criteria or a new processing step, which enhances the quality and safety of tissue and / or cells.

Premises, Facilities and Equipment

Standard

PFE1 The premises are fit for purpose.

- a) A risk assessment has been carried out of the premises to ensure that they are fit for purpose.
- b) There are procedures to review and maintain the safety of staff, visitors and patients.

- c) The premises have sufficient space for procedures to be carried out safely and efficiently.
- e) There are procedures to ensure that the premises are secure, and confidentiality is maintained.
- f) There is access to a nominated, registered medical practitioner and / or a scientific advisor to provide advice and oversee the establishment's medical and scientific activities.

PFE2 Environmental controls are in place to avoid potential contamination.

- a) Tissues and / or cells stored in quarantine are stored separately from tissue and / or cells that have been released from quarantine.
- c) There are procedures for cleaning and decontamination.
- d) Staff are provided with appropriate protective clothing and equipment that minimise the risk of contamination of tissue and / or cells and the risk of infection to themselves.

PFE3 There are appropriate facilities for the storage of tissues and / or cells, consumables and records.

- a) Tissues, cells, consumables and records are stored in secure environments and precautions are taken to minimise risk of damage, theft or contamination.
- b) There are systems to deal with emergencies on a 24-hour basis.
- c) Tissues and / or cells are stored in controlled, monitored and recorded conditions that maintain tissue and / or cell integrity.
- d) There is a documented, specified maximum storage period for tissues and / or cells.

PFE4 Systems are in place to protect the quality and integrity of tissues and / or cells during transport and delivery to its destination.

PFE5 Equipment is appropriate for use, maintained, quality assured, validated and where appropriate monitored.

- a) Critical equipment and technical devices are identified, validated, regularly inspected and records are maintained.
- b) Critical equipment is maintained and serviced in accordance with the manufacturer's instructions.
- c) Equipment affecting critical processes and storage parameters is identified and monitored to detect malfunctions and defects and procedures are in place to take any corrective actions.
- d) New and repaired equipment is validated before use and this is documented.
- e) There are documented agreements with maintenance companies.
- f) Cleaning, disinfection and sanitation of critical equipment is performed regularly, and this is recorded.
- h) Users have access to instructions for equipment and receive training in the use of equipment and maintenance where appropriate.
- i) Staff are aware of how to report an equipment problem.
- j) For each critical process, the materials, equipment and personnel are identified and documented.
- k) There are contingency plans for equipment failure.

Disposal

Standard

- D1 There is a clear and sensitive policy for disposing of tissues and / or cells.
- a) The disposal policy complies with HTA's Codes of Practice.
- b) The disposal procedure complies with Health and Safety recommendations.
- c) There is a documented procedure on disposal which ensures that there is no cross contamination.
- D2 The reasons for disposal and the methods used are carefully documented.
- a) There is a procedure for tracking the disposal of tissue and / or cells that details the method and reason for disposal.
- b) Disposal arrangements reflect (where applicable) the consent given for disposal.